### Educational ends and means

## McNamara's Fallacy and the coming robot apocalypse



Self portrait - ChatGPT4

Athabasca University FACULTY OF SCIENCE & TECHNOLOGY School of Computing & Information Systems



International Federation of National Teaching Fellows

Tampere University: Jon Dron & ChatGPT+, January 2024

### A few bad things I will probably not discuss today...



The AI apocalypse in the style of Leonardo, ChatGPT+

- and unreliability
- student • cheating
- bias •
- · the ethics of AI training
- privacy

- hallucinations · ownership of infrastructure
  - · job losses
  - exploitation of creators
  - environmental impacts
  - the AI apocalypse

# 50 words about me, by ChatGPT+



Dr. Jon Dron, a Full Professor and Associate Dean of Learning and Assessment at Athabasca University, is a distinguished figure in online education. He specializes in technology-enhanced learning and social media. His latest book, "How Education Works: Teaching, Technology, and Technique," reflects his profound influence in the field.

## A haiku about me, by ChatGPT+

Athabasca's guide, Dron teaches, tech intertwines, Education's new tide.



## **McNamara's Fallacy**

McNamara's Fallacy cautions against relying solely on quantifiable data for decision-making, warning that it omits crucial qualitative aspects. It underscores the limitation of numbers in capturing the full spectrum of complex realities, emphasizing that important elements often lie beyond the reach of metrics and thus remain unaccounted for.

-ChatGPT+'s explanation of McNamara's Fallacy, in precisely 50 words.



Robert McNamara

See, too, Goodhart's Law - when a measure becomes a target it ceases to be a good measure

### Defining "technology"

W. Brian Arthur:



Work

Technology, and Technics













## We are part-technology. Technology is part-us.



#### Participants, not (just) users

#### What can be done with this?



## Technique

What we do with what has been done

#### A technology enacted by a human







## Hard technique

#### We are parts of the orchestration

(methods, processes, procedures that *must* be done correctly)

## Soft technique

We are the orchestrators

(the ways we do stuff that can be done well but never correctly)



# The hard enables the soft



# We learn to do in order to learn to be

## Education

Amongst other things, but fundamentally...

A technology for developing the techniques needed to participate in the technologies of our cultures and societies



*Training* for hard technique *Learning* of soft technique



## Many teachers





#### How to do stuff Achieving credentials



#### How to be human in a human society

## Until now, automation has replaced only hard technique



#### Generative Als use other technologies





NICOLE ROBIE

GPT-4

Fullkason

**Generator** Inputs

Professional develo

Jaming Pantent of Tapic JavaSicitat program

.ates

90th

Journal of Creativity

#### KHARE JIMISON BUSINESS SEP 15, 2023 7:06 AM

#### Teachers Are Going All In on Generative Al

Surveys suggest teachers use generative AI more than students, to create lesson plans or more intere time but must be used carefully.

> Human-like problem-solving abilities in large language models using ChatGPT

#### Al companions to replace the prospectus?



The originality of machines: AI takes the **Torrance** Test

CULTURE DEC 24. 2823 7:00 MM

eative Commons license 7	open access	Bac - dev / has thei	Date: July 6, 202	
hlights PT-4 ranked in the top percentile for originality and it ests of Creative Thinking. Full lesson - generator Control Lesson 1 Here 99th Lesson 1 Here Control Lesson 2 Here 1 Versent 1 Here Control Lesson 2 Here 1 Versent 1 Here Control Lesson 2 Here 1 Versent 1 Here 1 Versent 1 Vers	Reduce Your Workload – Enhance Your		0 New research	rsity of Montana rch suggests an ers on a standar P in M PULL STOP New research fro
an Brite Phys. (Brite Phys. (Brite Phys.)) Brite Phys. (Brite Phys.) (Brite Phys.) Brite Phys. (Brite Phys.) (Brite Phys.) (Brite Phys.) Brite Phys. (Brite Phys.) (Brite Phys.) (Brite Phys.) (Brite Phys.) Brite Phys. (Brite Phys.) (Brite Phys.	Easily create multiple-choice tests and with Al-powered efficiency!	exams	n stivity sligence sectional	and its partners can star ChatO creati russere: arruny
est version of ChatGP h percentile	<ul> <li>Develop course descriptions, outcomes syllabi with a few clicks!</li> <li>T aces bar exam with s</li> </ul>		nearin	B trut 9 Tuttor B Torocol B Torocol

BY DEBR GALGOBOT - The College Companion Cha Publisher: IEEE Cile This Saksham Saraswat ; Siddhartha Mishra ; Vikas Mani ; Shristi Priya All Autho

A Comparative Study on ChatGPT and Fine-tuned

#### ChatGPT+ benefits to teachers (in 50 words, according to ChatGPT+)

ChatGPT+ offers teachers instant access to a vast information repository, enhancing lesson planning with diverse insights. Its Al-driven suggestions foster creative teaching approaches and personalized learning experiences. Additionally, it serves as a reliable tool for administrative tasks, reducing workload and allowing teachers more time to focus on student engagement and instruction.



#### ChatGPT+ benefits to learners (in 50 words, according to ChatGPT+)

ChatGPT+ aids learners by providing instant, diverse information, clarifying complex topics, and offering personalized educational support. It enhances self-paced learning, encourages exploration and curiosity, and assists in research and homework. The tool's interactivity fosters engagement, making learning more dynamic and adaptable to individual needs and learning styles.



#### Generative Als can be an excellent means to improve learning outcomes and educational attainment



(as we measure such things)



# Generative AI can be a great teacher

(as we measure such things)

## If it walks like a duck...



### But...



# ChatGPT doesn't have to empty the cat litter tray



## No one will ever pay \$5m for an original ChatGPT manuscript



Part of the manuscript of Mahler's 2nd symphony

#### Or \$2.4m for a massproduced guitar once played by an Al....



John Lennon's Gibson J-160E

# Guess which image I prefer?



Grandpa with pomegranates in his eyes, by ChatGPT+



Grandpa with pomegranates in his eyes, by Jasper, age 3

# What do children learn from stories?





#### What happens when we learn to be human from things that are not (quite) human?

### No identity

### No relationships

No values

### No beliefs



No passion

"ChatGPT" by ChatGPT

### No life history

### No intention

### No skin in the game

# Signals, but no signification





"We shape our dwellings and afterwards our dwellings shape our lives" (Churchill, as interpreted by ChatGPT+)

## This doesn't scale well

## A dystopian future?

Soft skills that atrophy

Soft skills that are never learned

A loss of meaning



## A dystopian future?

#### Learned ways of being that are not quite human

Machines trained on the output of machines

Machines trained on the output of people who are taught by machines



## Valorizing the human in an age of machines



#### Generative Als with separate, nonoverlapping roles





## Generative Als to support human connection

## Education as a community vs education as a product



### Contractors, team members, and partners, but not tools

Separate roles, not overlapping

# Supports for human connection



Contributors, matchmakers, catalysts, summarizers

## Reclaiming the social



### Community and connection vs product and process



# Revaluing human fingerprints and traces

## **Refocusing education**

With whom

Where

Why

In what way

not (just) what and how



Growth

Connection

Meaning

Value

not grades and credentials



#### Thank you

#### Here's a paper...

Dron, J. (2023). The Human Nature of Generative AIs and the Technological Nature of Humanity: Implications for Education. *Digital*, *3*(4), 319–335. <u>https://doi.org/</u> <u>10.3390/digital3040020</u>

#### https://www.mdpi.com/2673-6470/3/4/20

💌 jond@athabascau.ca

- https://jondron.ca/
- @jondron@mastodon.social



For the theory behind all this, read the book... https://howeducationworks.ca